



County Offices
Newland
Lincoln
LN1 1YL

26 October 2017

Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

A meeting of the Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy will be held on **Friday, 3 November 2017 at 10.30 am in Committee Room One, County Offices, Newland, Lincoln LN1 1YL** for the transaction of the business set out on the attached Agenda.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Tony McArdle', written over a horizontal line.

Tony McArdle
Chief Executive

Membership of the Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy (8 Members of the Council)

Councillors Mrs A M Newton (Chairman), S R Kirk (Vice-Chairman), D McNally, R A Renshaw, P A Skinner, A N Stokes, M J Storer and R H Trollope-Bellew

**SCRUTINY REVIEW: IMPACT OF THE PART NIGHT STREET LIGHTING POLICY
AGENDA
FRIDAY, 3 NOVEMBER 2017**

Item	Title	Pages
1	Apologies for Absence	
2	Declaration of Members' Interests	
3	The Scrutiny Review Process <i>(To receive a report by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, which sets out the Scrutiny Review Process and formal working arrangements for the review of the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy)</i>	5 - 10
4	Scoping Document - Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy <i>(To receive a report by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, which provides the Scrutiny Panel with the opportunity to consider and agree the scope and resources for the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy Scrutiny Review)</i>	11 - 18
5	Background Information: Introduction of Part Night Street Lighting <i>(To receive a report from John Monk, Group Manager Design Services, which provides background information to the Scrutiny Panel and describes the process by which part night lighting came to be implemented on a wide scale across Lincolnshire)</i>	19 - 30
6	Community Engagement and Future Engagement Activity <i>(To receive a report by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, and Rachel Wilson, Democratic Services Officer, which enables the Scrutiny Panel to engage in discussions with the Community Engagement Team to agree the purpose, scope and objectives of any engagement to be carried out as part of reviewing the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy)</i>	31 - 32
7	Evidence Gathering: Community Safety Partnership and Road Safety Partnership <i>(This is an opportunity for the Scrutiny Panel to discuss areas for further investigation with Claire Seabourne, Safer Communities Service and Graeme Butler, Road Safety Partnership)</i>	
8	Future Scrutiny Panel Meeting Arrangements <i>(To discuss and agreed the future meeting arrangements for the Scrutiny Panel)</i>	

Democratic Services Officer Contact Details

Name: **Rachel Wilson**

Direct Dial **01522 552107**

E Mail Address rachel.wilson@lincolnshire.gov.uk

Please note: for more information about any of the following please contact the Democratic Services Officer responsible for servicing this meeting

- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports

Contact details set out above.

All papers for council meetings are available on:
www.lincolnshire.gov.uk/committeerecords

Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

Date: **03 November 2017**

Subject: **The Scrutiny Review Process**

Summary:

Scrutiny Reviews represent an opportunity for scrutiny councillors to delve deeper into a particular subject and recommend any ways in which things might be improved at a level of scrutiny not always possible within the time limits and formal setting associated with Committee meetings.

This report sets out the Scrutiny Review process and formal working arrangements for the review of the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

Actions Required:

The Scrutiny Panel are requested to endorse the Scrutiny Review process and working arrangements in relation to the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy Scrutiny Review as set out in the report.

1. Background

A review into the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy was approved by the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board in July 2017. This scrutiny review will look at the impact of the change in the Street Lighting Policy to turn street lights off in certain areas at midnight and consider a number of different areas where there may have been an impact as a result of this change.

Over the coming months this Scrutiny Panel will gather evidence through a variety of methods and produce a report to be submitted to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board. The final report will be based only on the facts gathered throughout the course of the review and will give a full picture of the issues under scrutiny. It will reflect the range of views presented to the Scrutiny Panel and will contain conclusions and clear recommendations.

The Overview and Scrutiny Management Board will consider the final report and can then refer the report to the Executive, asking them to consider the recommendations arising from the review. A formal response will then be made by the Council's Executive or a particular Executive Councillor to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board.

Where recommendations are accepted by the Executive or Executive Councillor, an action plan will be produced that will highlight how these recommendations will be implemented and over what time period. The relevant committee(s) will then agree a time at which these recommendations should be revisited to confirm that implementation has taken place.

2. Scrutiny Panel Working Arrangements

Although scrutiny panels are not committees of the Council or subject to the rules set out in the Council's Constitution, meetings will generally be held in public where possible, with decisions on whether meetings should be held in public or private being considered as part of the review process. However, there will be occasions when it is necessary to hold 'informal meetings' in private.

Meetings Held in Public

Where meetings are held in public they will operate as if they are governed by Part 4⁽¹⁾ of the Constitution and will seek as far as possible to apply the Council's rules of procedure. An agenda will be published and made available on the Council's website and members of the public, press and other county councillors will be able to attend and observe the meeting. However, there is no automatic right for members of the public to address the Scrutiny Panel at these meetings held in public. Minutes will be produced which will be made publicly available.

Informal Meetings

The Scrutiny Panel may hold informal meetings to deal with any informal business or to discuss learning from previous meetings and how this impacts on the review; this could also include consideration of evidence, interviewing people, or working to formulate any comments or recommendations as part of the drafting of the final report following investigations.

Where the Scrutiny Panel holds an informal meeting, the agenda produced will be made available to the members of the Scrutiny Panel and officers only. Members of the public and the press are not able to attend and observe informal meetings; other county councillors may attend with the permission of the Chairman. For transparency the dates of informal meetings will be listed on the County Council website.

3. Roles and Responsibilities

Role of Members

Scrutiny Panels are Member-led and Members should control the direction and operate within the agreed scoping for the review. Members are responsible for setting the agenda and should not do anything to undermine or pre-empt the outcome of the review. Members are also responsible for questioning and

¹ Part 4 - Rules of Procedure (<https://www.lincolnshire.gov.uk/local-democracy/how-the-council-works/the-constitution/part-4-rules-of-procedure/73387.article>)

considering evidence from key contributors on issues related to the specific review subject.

Members should declare any interests not already listed on their declaration of pecuniary interests form (DPI) in any matter being considered at a meeting of the Scrutiny Panel. The Member should withdraw from the meeting should they have a DPI relating to the content of the meeting. Recommendations should also take account of and any financial or legal impacts.

Members are responsible for making recommendations in the final report (officers are not part of the decision making process) and in so doing should be mindful of equality and diversity principles and any financial impact.

Role of Senior Officers

Senior Officers are expected to provide detailed information, advice and guidance to Members on the subject area under review, including written reports or documents on specific issues for discussion.

Officers will aid members by identifying and highlighting any potential implications from the findings and recommendations of the review. Officers will also look to identify and highlight the impact of any potential recommendations and will also work with Members to suggest potential solutions to any issues identified.

Role of Democratic Services

The assigned Democratic Services Officer will arrange suitable venues for meetings and prepare agendas and distribute paperwork for meetings in line with agreed timescales. The Democratic Services Officer will also record the minutes at public meetings and compile notes at informal meetings.

The assigned Scrutiny Officer will provide comprehensive advice and guidance to Members and officers throughout the review process and lead on the project management of the review. The Scrutiny Officer will also draft the final report on behalf of the Scrutiny Panel members.

The Scrutiny Officer's role can also include:

- Carrying out or commissioning research, analysis and preparation of information relevant to the review.
- Liaising with Executive Councillors and identified departmental lead officers on the direction of the review.
- Advising and supporting Directorates in working with elected members, when contributing to a review.
- Securing sufficient expert resource from the relevant Directorate to contribute to the work of the review.
- Supporting contributors throughout the overview and scrutiny process.
- Arranging fact-finding visits in relation to the review.

4. Scrutiny Review Process

Scope the review

- determine the key issues and objectives
- identify key stakeholders
- identify who needs to be involved
- decide what evidence needs to be gathered and how
- consider potential risks and ways of managing them

Gather evidence

- undertake engagement, surveys, workshops and focus groups as appropriate
- source data and reports
- interview experts and other appropriate witnesses
- work with officers to research issues

Evaluate evidence

- consider all the evidence in the context of the scope of the review
- look at evidence alongside other sources of data to gain a comprehensive view of the impacts identified

Report and make recommendations

- document the work carried out and what conclusions have been reached
- make recommendations
- distribute the report and recommendations to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board for approval
- distribute the report and recommendations to the Executive for a response (to be provided within two months)

Implementation by the Executive / officers

- agree and develop an implementation plan
- feedback outcomes to stakeholders, including the local community

Monitoring

- track progress of the changes being implemented
- conduct further investigation and make additional recommendations if necessary

5. Gathering Evidence

The Scrutiny Panel will aim to seek views and evidence from those with relevant knowledge, expertise or experience to help inform the outcome for the review process. The Panel may gather evidence through a variety of methods, which can include:

- written evidence
- oral evidence and interviews with external and internal witnesses
- site visits

- visiting other organisations - partners, user groups, other councils
- research
- holding specific meetings where members of the public may put forward their views on an issue
- talking to people who are affected by the issue

The Scrutiny Panel will consider appropriate engagement activity and evidence gathering at its first meeting on 03 November 2017. However it is proposed that written evidence may be submitted throughout the review period using the following methods –

By email – Scrutiny@lincolnshire.gov.uk

By post – Democratic Services, Lincolnshire County Council, County Offices, Newland, LINCOLN LN1 1YL

A closing date for written submissions will need to be agreed by the Scrutiny Panel as part of planning the future engagement activity.

6. Background Papers

There are no background papers used in the preparation of this report.

This report was written by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, who can be contacted on 01522 552102 or by e-mail at daniel.steel@lincolnshire.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

Date: **03 November 2017**

Subject: **Scoping Document: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy**

Summary:

To be effective, a scrutiny review must be clearly defined to make sure that the review achieves its aims and has effective outcomes. One of the most important ways to make sure that a review goes well is to ensure that it is well defined at the outset.

The purpose of this report is for the Scrutiny Panel to consider and agree the scope and resources for the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy Scrutiny Review. The proposed scope is attached at Appendix A.

Actions Required:

The Scrutiny Panel are invited to consider and note the scope for the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy Scrutiny Review.

1. Background

A review into the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy was approved by the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board in July 2017. Since the meeting, the chairman and vice chairman of the scrutiny panel, relevant Executive Councillors and senior officers have been consulted to develop a clear proposed scope for the review into the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

Proposed Scope

This review will consider the impact of the change in the Street Lighting Policy to turn street lights off in certain areas at midnight. The review will consider a number of different areas where there may have been an impact, either positive or negative, as a result of this change and make recommendations based on its findings where any improvements could be made.

It is important to highlight that this review is examining the impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy and all other elements of the Street Lighting Policy are excluded from the review.

The aim of the review will be to seek to ensure that the Council's Street Light Policy in relation to part night lighting is being managed to minimise the adverse impact on the communities in Lincolnshire affected by the changes.

When considering this topic for a formal review it was stressed that the timing of the review is key. In particular a need to include data from the winter months, to ensure that any seasonal variations were considered was highlighted by key stakeholders.

The objectives of the review are as follows:

- Examine the impact of switching off street lights at midnight on different areas such as on the environment; crime rates; fears about safety and crime; emergency services; health and public health services.
- Consider data and substantiated evidence, such as crime rate figures, accident data, complaint figures, and exemption requests, regarding the impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.
- Consider the wider economic impact of Part Night Street Lighting on business, including the impact on the night time economy.
- Invite the views of members of the public, County Councillors, district councils and parish/town councils regarding the perceived impact on crime rates, and fears of crime and safety.
- Conduct comparisons with other Local Authorities who have also changed their street lighting policy to incorporate part night lighting.
- Investigate potential savings or cost implications arising from any proposed changes to the Part Night Street Lighting Policy within the allocated budget.

Reporting

It is proposed that this review will last for six months from November 2017 to April 2018 and report back to the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board at its meeting on 28 April 2018.

2. Conclusion

The Scrutiny Panel is requested to consider and note the scope and resources for the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy Scrutiny Review.

It is recommended that the Panel notes the scope and approach set out in respect of the planned Scrutiny Review of Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

3. Appendices

These are listed below and attached at the back of the report	
APPENDIX A	Scoping Document – Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

4. Background Papers

There are no background papers used in the preparation of this report.

This report was written by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, who can be contacted on 01522 552102 or by e-mail at daniel.steel@lincolnshire.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

PART NIGHT STREET LIGHTING POLICY Scrutiny Review Scope

Scrutiny Reviews represent an opportunity for scrutiny councillors to delve deeper into a particular subject or issue to find out more, speak to the individuals responsible and service users and recommend any ways in which things might be improved at a level of scrutiny not always possible within the time limits and formal setting associated with Committee meetings.

It is important that in-depth reviews are:-

- deliverable within a set timetable
- sufficiently focused on a particular aspect of a service
- not duplicating other significant review activity
- not related to a specific individual grievance or complaint

Reviews should also:-

- contribute to the overall objectives of the organisation
- reflect community concerns
- lead to potential achievable outcomes or improvements for the people of Lincolnshire

DETAILS OF SCRUTINY REVIEW TOPIC

Title of Review	Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy
Committee	Overview and Scrutiny Management Board
Purpose of the Review	This review will look at the impact of the change in the Street Lighting Policy to turn street lights off in certain areas at midnight. The review will consider a number of different areas where there may have been an impact, either positive or negative, as a result of this change.
Main Lines of Enquiry	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To consider key national and local documents and guidance in relation to the Part Night Street Lighting Policy. 2. To examine the impact of switching off street lights at midnight on different areas such as on the environment; crime rates; fears about safety and crime; emergency services; health and public health services. 3. To consider data and substantiated evidence, such as crime rate figures, accident data, complaint figures, and

	<p>exemption requests, regarding the impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. To consider the wider economic impact of Part Night Street Lighting on business, including the impact on the night time economy. 5. To invite the views of members of the public, County Councillors, district councils and parish/town councils regarding the perceived impact on crime rates, and fears of crime and safety. 6. To conduct comparisons with other Local Authorities who have also changed their street lighting policy to incorporate part night lighting. 7. To investigate potential savings or cost implications arising from any proposed changes to the Part Night Street Lighting Policy within the allocated budget.
<p>Is there anything excluded from the review?</p>	<p>This review is examining the impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy. All other elements of the Street Lighting Policy are excluded from this review.</p>
<p>Benefits of the Review</p>	<p>This review will seek to ensure that the Council's new Street Light Policy in relation to part night lighting is being managed to minimise the adverse impact on the communities in Lincolnshire affected by the changes.</p>
<p>Risks and Implications (Legal / Financial / Resource)</p>	<p>There will be a requirement for increased resources to support this review.</p> <p>There may be legal and/or financial issues identified during the course of the review and appropriate advice will be taken at the time.</p> <p>Personal data may be recorded during the review and this must be managed and reproduced in accordance with Data Protection legislation.</p> <p>Costs may arise from transport for councillors, officers and contributors and from holding meetings at alternative venues.</p> <p>An Equality Impact Analysis may be required to support any decision making in respect of the review.</p> <p>The major resource during this review relates to the time committed by Councillors, County Council officers and contributors from external organisations.</p>

Any further information (including any relevant information relating to the guidelines)	There will be a need to include data from the winter months, to ensure that any seasonal variations are considered.	
Deadlines for submission to:	Scrutiny Committee 26 April 2018	Executive 5 June 2018

GENERAL INFORMATION

Membership of Scrutiny Panel	Cllr Mrs A M Newton (Chairman), Cllr S R Kirk (Vice-Chairman), Cllr D McNally, Cllr R Renshaw, Cllr P A Skinner, Cllr A N Stokes, Cllr M J Storer, Cllr R H Trollope-Bellew
Relevant Executive Councillor(s)	Cllr R G Davies (Executive Councillor: Highways, Transport and IT)
Lead Officer(s) from Theme Area	Andy Gutherson (County Commissioner, Environment and Economy) Steve Willis (Chief Operating Officer) Paul Rusted (Infrastructure Commissioner) John Monk (Group Manager - Design Services) County Officer – Public Protection
Scrutiny Officer	Tracy Johnson (Senior Scrutiny Officer) Daniel Steel (Scrutiny Officer)
Democratic Services Officer	Rachel Wilson (Democratic Services Officer)

RESEARCH METHODS AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

Key Documents / Best Practice Guidance	Lincolnshire County Council's Part Night Street Lighting Policy Street Lighting Transformation Project – Decision Documents LANTERNS (Local Authority Collaborators' National Evaluation of Reduced Night-Time Streetlight) Part night street lighting policies at other Local Authorities
---	---

<p>Key Contributors (e.g. key officers, councillors, expert witnesses, and stakeholders)</p>	<p>Richard Wills, Executive Director of Environment and Economy Councillor Richard Davies, Executive Councillor for Highways, Transport and IT Lincolnshire Road Safety Partnership Lincolnshire Community Safety Partnership Lincolnshire Police Lincolnshire Fire and Rescue (LFR) East Midlands Ambulance Service (EMAS) District Councils Parish/Town Councils Lincolnshire Association of Local Councils (LALC) County and District Councils' Economic Growth Teams Greater Lincolnshire Local Enterprise Partnership (GLLEP)</p>
<p>Site Visits</p>	<p>Site visits will be undertaken as required.</p>
<p>Engagement Activity (Questionnaires / Focus Groups / Workshops / Website / Public Meetings)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To invite views from members of the public to be considered as part the Scrutiny Review process. • To invite the views of, and hold meetings with, Key Contributors.

Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

Date: **03 November 2017**

Subject: **Background Information: Introduction of Part Night Street Lighting**

Summary:

The purpose of this report is to provide background information to the Scrutiny Panel and describe the process by which part night lighting came to be implemented on a wide scale across Lincolnshire.

The current Street Lighting Policy (effective from 18 July 2016) is attached at Appendix A.

Actions Required:

The Scrutiny Panel is invited to:

1. Consider the background of the implementation of Part Night Street Lighting, and;
2. Explore any additional avenues of investigation or information the Panel would like to consider in the future.

1. Background

Due to ongoing constraints on revenue budgets across the County Council, the possibility of savings from changes to the street lighting service started being explored in depth during 2015. In order to assist in delivering savings, a capital investment of £6.4M was approved in January 2016 from the County Council's Future Capital Development Contingency, allowing an invest-to-save project to be implemented.

The Street Lighting Transformation Project was developed in parallel with the identification of the capital investment and was predicated on alterations to the street lighting policy to allow changes to be implemented.

1.1 Street Lighting Transformation Project

The Project, which ran from April 2016, used the capital investment alongside normal budgets to implement the hierarchy of provision as detailed in the street lighting policy (see below). This resulted in three main strands to the Project within the constraints of the budget:

- Conversion to LED (dimmed at times of low use) of just over 17,000 higher wattage lights on trafficked routes
- Complete switch off of 870 higher wattage lights on trafficked routes
- Conversion to part night lighting of just less than 44,000 lights, with otherwise eligible lights being left on as they met defined exemption criteria (see below).

The Project was substantially completed within the 2016/17 financial year, which is a significant achievement considering the resources, logistics and area covered by the Project. Some works continued into the current financial year, including conversion to part night LED of lights which require scaffolding for access (now completed) and conversion to LED of heritage-style lights which require specific design work and equipment with long order times (some of this work is still ongoing).

1.2 Part Night Lighting

Part night lighting is when street lights are switched off for a period of time during the night. The times at which lights are switched off in Lincolnshire are from around midnight until 6am, if light levels require it. The timing is governed by intelligent photo-cells which – on installation – assess the length of the night and whether it is getting longer or shorter to see what time of year it is, and then adjusting its timings accordingly. Typically, they also have an adjustment period around the time that the clocks change.

Part night lighting has been applied to new development roads within Lincolnshire since 2010, so was not an innovation when introduced more widely as part of the Transformation project.

1.3 Policy Changes

The timeline and detail of Street Lighting Policy changes pertinent to this Scrutiny Review are as follows:

14/09/2015 Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee consider proposals to amend the previous Street Lighting Policy implemented in January 2013, in particular to work through a hierarchy for existing street lights wherever practicable (see below, but noting that part night lighting was defined as Dusk to 24:00 and 05:30 to Dawn).

04/11/2015 Policy Decision by the Executive Councillor for Highways, Transport and IT to adopt the changes discussed and recommended by the Scrutiny Committee on 14/09/2015.

01/03/2016 Policy Decision by the Executive Councillor for Highways, Transport and IT to amend the September 2015 Street Lighting Policy, made subsequent to the approval of the £6.4M capital investment. The amendments updated the hierarchy to be worked through for existing street lights wherever practicable to be as follows:

1. Complete removal of lights (subject to a lighting assessment and local engagement) where this is the most financially sustainable solution considering removal costs.

2. Turning lights off (subject to a lighting assessment)
3. Part night lighting (up to the last junction on a route Dusk to 2400 then 0600 to Dawn; beyond the last junction on a route Dusk to 2200 then 0600 to Dawn)
4. Dimming lights
5. As a last resort, leaving lights fully lit during normal lighting hours.

The Decision paper included a section on Implementation of the Policy, which whilst not part of the Policy includes principles regarding how it should be applied. In relation to the application of part-night lighting it proposed that existing lights be converted to part-night lighting as part of the Street Lighting Transformation project. In residential and commercial areas, this would be where columns are 6m tall or less. On industrial estates, all columns would be part-night lit.

It also set out in principle that a location with any of the following characteristics could be considered for an exemption in determining the final application of the policy relating to part-night lighting:

- A significant record of night-time road traffic accidents, as advised by the Lincolnshire Road Safety Partnership
- A significant record of night-time crime, as advised by the Police or Community Safety Partnership
- An adjoining care / nursing home, sheltered housing, or warden controlled accommodation
- An operational emergency service facility, including Fire, Ambulance, Police, Coast Guard, or Hospital with 24 hour A&E
- A highway safety feature, such as traffic calming, speed humps, zebra crossings etc.
- A significant night time economy, defined as the centre of a major urban area or larger town as referred to in the County Council's Local Transport Plan 4
- Permanent Local Authority or Police CCTV surveillance equipment
- A footpath and / or cycleway that links to a road that has all night lighting

This Decision had not been considered in advance by the Scrutiny Committee. This was because the process of finalising the capital investment for the project included consideration of a number of options with a range of pay back periods. The majority of these options would have required an amendment of some sort to the street lighting policy before implementation. It was decided to wait until the capital investment was confirmed through an executive decision before proceeding with the finalisation of the street lighting policy. This reduced the risk of a resulting mismatch between the option decided upon, the funding being available and the policy.

Hence, this Decision was therefore subject to call in. However, no call in was made and so the Decision was implemented after the call in period.

13/06/2016 Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee receive an update on the implementation of the Street Lighting Transformation Project and consider proposals to further amend the Street Lighting Policy, taking into account public response to the part night lighting, so that part night lighting is only Dusk to 2400 then 0600 to Dawn.

18/07/2016 Policy Decision by the Executive Councillor for Highways, Transport and IT to adopt the changes discussed and recommended by the Scrutiny Committee on 13/06/2016.

12/09/2016 Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee receive an update on progress on the implementation of the Street Lighting Transformation Project.

27/02/2017 Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee receive an update on progress on the implementation of the Street Lighting Transformation Project.

1.4 Transformation Project Communications

In preparation for and during the implementation of the Transformation Project specific communications were undertaken through a range of proactive and reactive means. These were in addition to the fact that all the Scrutiny and Decision papers referred to above are publicly available.

Two editions of County News (which is delivered to every household in the county) carried articles on the Project, including details of the changes and where to find further information. This included a page on the County Council's website, accessible via www.lincolnshire.gov.uk/streetlighting. A number of press releases combined with social media articles were published by the Council's communications team.

The changes and Project were picked up extensively by the local media, resulting in a number of articles in local newspapers, and items and interviews on local radio and television. Responses were made by Officers and Members.

1.5 Transformation Project Outputs

The changes implemented through the Street Lighting Transformation Project have resulted in:

- More than 50% reduction in energy consumption by street lighting across the County
- Over 6,200 tonnes of CO₂ saved year on year
- Over £1.7M revenue saving from the street lighting budget.

2. Conclusion

The purpose of this report is to provide the Scrutiny Panel with background information on the transition to Part Night Street Lighting in Lincolnshire implemented as part of the Street Lighting Transformation Project between April 2016 and March 2017.

The Scrutiny Panel is invited to consider the background of the implementation of Part Night Street Lighting, and; Explore any additional avenues of investigation or information they would like to consider in the future.

3. Appendices

These are listed below and attached at the back of the report	
APPENDIX A	STREET LIGHTING POLICY – As per Executive Decision I011656 Effective from 18 July 2016

4. Background Papers

Document title	Where the document can be viewed
Street Lighting Policy Amendment (I011656) 18 July 2016	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieDecisionDetails.aspx?ID=308
Street Lighting Policy Amendments (I010733) 01 March 2016	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieDecisionDetails.aspx?ID=283
Street Lighting Policy Amendments (I010082) 04 November 2015	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieDecisionDetails.aspx?ID=254
Street Lighting Transformation Project Update - Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee Monday, 27th February, 2017	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=492&MId=4763&Ver=4
Street Lighting Transformation Project Update - Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee Monday, 12th September, 2016	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=492&MId=4521&Ver=4
Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee Monday, 13th June, 2016 - Street Lighting Transformation Project Update	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=492&MId=4519&Ver=4
Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee Monday, 14th September, 2015 - Street Lighting Policy	http://lincolnshire.moderngov.co.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=492&MId=4286&Ver=4

This report was written by John Monk, who can be contacted on 01522 552394 or john.monk@lincolnshire.gov.uk.

This page is intentionally left blank

STREET LIGHTING POLICY – As per Executive Decision I011656

Effective from 18 July 2016

1.0 POWERS IN RELATION TO STREET LIGHTING

- 1.1** Under the Highways Act 1980, Lincolnshire County Council:
- is the Highway Authority within the county of Lincolnshire
 - is the prime Street Lighting Authority in the county of Lincolnshire
 - is empowered to light roads
 - does not have a duty to provide lighting for roads.
- 1.2** Other local councils in Lincolnshire have or may adopt powers to provide street lighting (eg City, Borough, District and Parish Councils).
- 1.3** Highways England (HE), as the government company responsible for Trunk Roads across the country, may provide street lighting for Trunk Roads within Lincolnshire.

2.0 STREET LIGHTING ON EXISTING ROADS

- 2.1** On existing adopted roads, the County Council will, as far as practicable, ensure its lighting forms a sustainable network by managing energy consumption to a minimum by:
- A. Working through the following hierarchy for existing street lights wherever practicable, including when lighting comes to the end of its useful life:
 1. Complete removal of lights (subject to a lighting assessment and local engagement) where this is the most financially sustainable solution considering removal costs.
 2. Turning lights off (subject to a lighting assessment)
 3. Part night lighting as described in section 7.5 of this policy.
 4. Dimming lights as described in section 7.5 of this policy.
 5. As a last resort, leaving lights fully lit during normal lighting hours.
 - B. Only supporting the provision of additional street lights on the existing highway where they are part night lit or dimmed and either:
 1. they are financed by other local councils in Lincolnshire, in which case the County Council will adopt and maintain them without a commuted sum or;
 2. it is in the interest of improving road safety (see 3.0 below) and finance is available from road safety budgets or;
 3. they are paid for as part of a S278 scheme required for a developer to comply with a planning condition and are accompanied by a commuted sum or;
 4. they are requested and paid for by major trip or abnormal load generators and are accompanied by a commuted sum.
 - C. Considering removal or replacement of existing street lighting, taking account of the hierarchy in A above:
 1. when it comes to the end of its useful life and it is financially sustainable in the specific location, considering replacement or removal costs or;
 2. when paid for as part of a S278 scheme required for a developer to comply with a planning condition or;
 3. it is requested and paid for by major trip or abnormal load generators

- 2.2 County Council funding for street lighting shall be restricted to publicly maintainable adopted highway.
- 2.3 Requests for the addition, removal or replacement of street lights from individuals or community groups will be required to be directed through the relevant Parish, Town, City or Borough Council.
- 2.4 Where the County Council does not own the street lighting on existing highway, requests for the addition, removal or replacement of the street lights will be forwarded to the owner of the lighting.
- 2.8 Subject to the County Council having funding available, any all-night footway lighting may be converted to part night in areas nominated by the relevant Parish Council.

3.0 STREET LIGHTING TO IMPROVE ROAD SAFETY

- 3.1 Improvements will be considered (subject to budget constraints) where there is a night to day accident ratio greater than 2:1 and
- There is a proven accident record over the last three years bearing in mind the causes of the accidents and
 - Where there have been a minimum of three separate night time injury accidents within 1km of road and
 - Simpler engineering alternatives have been tried and have not been successful.
- 3.2 Improvements to street lighting for road safety purposes will be subject to the availability of finance from road safety budgets.

4.0 STREET LIGHTING AS AN AID TO COMBAT CRIME

- 4.1 In accordance with street lighting design standards, street lighting designs shall give special consideration to increased lighting levels in higher crime areas. This consideration shall remain an integral part of the street lighting design process and shall be identified through liaison with the police.
- 4.2 Subject to engineering constraints the County Council will cooperate with law enforcement agencies and local authority CCTV operators who wish to use street lights as a convenient support and electricity supply point for CCTV camera equipment intended for monitoring possible criminal activities on the highway. County Council street lights will not be used for mounting CCTV equipment used only for monitoring activity off the highway.

5.0 STREET LIGHTING FOR NEW ROADS AND ROAD IMPROVEMENTS

- 5.1 Subject to environmental and cost considerations Street Lighting may be provided on new sections of road where an economic assessment carried out in accordance with the DfT standard "TA 49/07 Appraisal of New and Replacement Road Lighting" determines that there will be a cost benefit in terms of accident savings.

5.2 Where the application of this standard determines that lighting is not required then a separate risk assessment shall then be applied to adjacent connecting junctions, roundabouts and all other road features to ascertain lighting requirements.

5.3 Where street lighting is justified on a new section of road (excluding development roads – See Section 6 of this policy), the hierarchy described in Section 2.1 A of this policy shall be followed.

6.0 STREET LIGHTING FOR DEVELOPMENT ROADS

6.1 Street Lighting will normally be provided by the developer and adopted by the County Council under the terms of section 38 or section 278 of the Highways Act 1980 or section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990. On section 38 schemes, street lighting shall be part-night lit (see Section 7.5 of this policy).

6.2 In accordance with highway adoption procedures, lighting installations on proposed highway will be adopted concurrently with the rest of the adoption.

6.3 The developer will be responsible for all repairs, maintenance and energy charges prior to the adoption date.

6.4 The County Council as The Highway Authority may approve installations of decorative street lighting equipment where such lighting forms part of a system of highway lighting and proposed schemes are of comparable efficiency to standard road lighting

6.5 Victorian period style or contemporary styled equipment may be approved where architectural or environmental issues need to be addressed in order to maintain the character of the locality.

6.6 Where a developer has chosen to depart from normal standards and this departure would ultimately lead to the County Council incurring higher than normal maintenance costs, Developers will be charged a commuted sum.

6.7 Calculation of a commuted sum will be in accordance with HAT 40.

6.8 The developer shall pay electricity charges for road lighting and illuminated signs until adopted by the County Council.

7.0 STREET LIGHTING STANDARDS

7.1 Street Lighting installations shall be the minimum standard for each class of road and designed in accordance with the recommendations contained in BS:5489 -1:2013 and BS EN 13201-2:2013.

7.2 In the interest of economy during the whole life of a street lighting installation designers shall be permitted to manage reasonable relaxations or departures from the recommendations contained in BS 5489 2013

7.3 Street lighting associated electrical installations shall comply with: BS 7671 17th edition 2011: The Requirements for Electrical Installations.

7.4 LED and HID white light lamps shall be the preferred light source throughout the county.

- 7.5** Street Lighting burning hours will normally* be:
Part Night Lighting: Dusk to 24:00 then
06:00 to Dawn
Dusk and Dawn switching levels as All Night Lighting
Dimmed Lighting: Depending on road geometry, expected use, traffic volumes and speed:
21:00 to 06:00 dimmed to 75% OR
24:00 to 06:00 dimmed to 75% OR
20:00 to 24:00 dimmed to 75% then to 06:00 dimmed to 50%
Dusk and Dawn switching levels as All Night Lighting
All Night Lighting: Dusk to Dawn 35 LUX on and 18 LUX off
Pedestrian Subway lighting twenty-four hour operation

* The UK adjusts clocks between British Summertime and Greenwich Mean Time in the spring and autumn. The lights have individual sensors that monitor the number of daylight hours, which is how they set their internal clock. This is then used to adjust for the change to British Summertime or Greenwich Mean Time. That means the sensors on the part-night lights enter a period of adjustment during spring and autumn, where the lights may start to turn off, or dim, slightly earlier or later than normal. Unfortunately, this is unavoidable but should have little or no impact on safety.

- 7.6** To minimise light pollution, lanterns on principal routes, major traffic routes and towns centre areas shall have a cut off distribution to minimise upward light glow with little or no light emitted above the horizontal, conforming to a minimum G4 luminous intensity rating.
- 7.7** Low energy electronic control gear and photocells shall be used.
- 7.8** In dimmed areas the levels of light at the bright and dimmed phases shall be compatible with an appropriate standard derived from BS 5489 – 1: 2013 and BS EN 13201-2: 2013

8.0 STREET LIGHTING, OPERATION, MAINTENANCE AND INSPECTION

- 8.1** Inventory shall be maintained to satisfy the requirements of the Un-Metered electricity supplies balancing and settlement code BSCP520, and the County Councils Asset Management Plan.

8.2 MAINTENANCE INTERVALS

Shall be carried out in accordance with the County Council's Highways Asset Management Plan

9.0 ELECTRICITY SUPPLY

- 9.1** Subject to the electricity Distribution Network Operators' conditions a live electricity service will be provided to each lighting point. Circumstances may require the County Council to install independent cables and supply pillars. Details of all electricity service providers will be recorded in the Highways Asset Management System.

10.0 STREET LIGHTING DESIGN SERVICES

- 10.1** Where requested to do so the County Council's Technical Services Partnership will provide the design and supervision resource for street lighting schemes.
- 10.2** Due to the complexity and specialism of highway electrical work, specification and supervision of any type of highway electrical equipment shall be undertaken by the County Councils Technical Services Partnership.
- 10.3** The design cost of street lighting schemes will be recharged to the client (i.e. developer or local authority) that commissions the work.
- 10.4** Fees for design services will be charged to recover the cost of design work, site supervision, administration and contract preliminaries
- 10.5** In accordance with the county council's sustainability programme to reduce carbon emissions lighting replacement schemes shall be designed with a target of reducing energy consumption by a minimum of 40% in comparison to the lights being replaced.
- 10.6** Street Lighting proposals in conservation areas and areas of outstanding natural beauty will be referred to the appropriate planning authority for comment

11.0 ADOPTION OF STREET LIGHTING FROM OTHER LOCAL LIGHTING AUTHORITIES

- 11.1** Where a local authority requests the County Council to adopt existing street lights it shall be considered subject to budgetary constraints and formal agreement. The condition of the existing street lights will also be taken into account and may require a payment to cover the cost of bringing them up to serviceable, current standards.
- 11.2** Additional street lights on the existing highway that are financed by other local councils in Lincolnshire may be adopted and maintained by the county council without a commuted sum, unless they are surrounded by an existing lighting scheme currently owned by another authority, in which case they will be approached to take ownership.

12.0 SHARED SERVICES PROVISION

- 12.1** The street lighting service has been identified as one in which service provision can be shared between participating authorities.
- 12.2** A service level agreement relating to "Maintenance of Unmetered Open Space Lighting" has been established pursuant to and subject to the conditions set out in the Collaboration Agreement dated 4 September 2008 made by the Lincolnshire Shared Services Partnership.
- 12.3** Participating authorities may be District, Parish, Town, City or Borough councils within Lincolnshire.
- 12.4** Participating authorities will retain ownership of their street lights, pay energy charges, meet the full cost of maintenance and replacements, and meet full cost of providing additional lights including connection charges and commuted sums.

12.5 Should they resolve to invest in the installation of communication nodes on their street lights participating authorities may also have their lights controlled by the Lincolnshire Central Management System as and when one is implemented.

13.0 PASSIVE SAFE LIGHTING COLUMNS

13.1 A passive safe lighting column is designed to yield when it is struck by an errant vehicle thus making the collision less severe.

13.2 Passive safe columns shall be used in individual circumstances where a detailed risk assessment has taken place and there is an increased likelihood that the column may be struck by an errant vehicle.

13.3 In the interest of road safety the option of not replacing columns at vulnerable locations shall be considered.

14.0 CENTRAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM (CMS)

14.1 Subject to funding being available, it is the policy of the County Council to implement a CMS system for the control of street lighting in Lincolnshire.

14.2 CMS shall be used to control street lights and provide an adaptable and flexible street lighting network.

14.3 CMS may be used to manage lights according to the hierarchy in 2.1A above. Upon request from the appropriate authority, lights may be switched on or light output increased at sites where there is:

- Congestion
- Road works
- Incidents such as road traffic collisions, flooding etc.
- Localised reports of high crime or vandalism

14.4 Subject to them investing in the installation of communication nodes on their street lights, and paying for any other hardware or software expansions required, lighting authorities within Lincolnshire and neighbouring areas may make use of the CMS to manage their lights.

14.5 Participating authorities shall meet the full cost of providing CMS for their lights

Scrutiny Review: Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy

Date: **03 November 2017**

Subject: **Community Engagement and Future Engagement Activity**

Summary:

This discussion item enables the Scrutiny Panel to engage with the Community Engagement Team to agree the purpose, scope and objectives of any engagement to be carried out as part of reviewing the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

Actions Required:

The Scrutiny Panel is invited to discuss and agree the scope, methods and objectives of any Community Engagement activity to be carried out as part of reviewing the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

1. Background

As an activity, 'engagement' is defined as on-going, regular dialogue and includes collaborative approaches to working with our communities and partners. It is generally seen to offer great value in ensuring we make informed decisions, with stakeholders involved throughout the whole process.

To achieve the Council's aim of engaging with communities effectively it is proposed that Community Engagement Team supports the Scrutiny Panel in developing a clear and focused approach as part of the Scrutiny Review process.

In carrying out engagement as part of this scrutiny review, there are a number of areas that councillors may want to consider; these include:

- The types of things that councillors may want to measure
- The type of questions to be included – open/closed answer, etc
- How the responses will be measured

Councillors may also wish to consider, as a starting point, measuring residents' views in relation to the following:

- Feelings of safety since the implementation of the policy
- Frequency of travel between the hours when lights are switched off
- Main concerns of the part night street lighting policy
- Use of other methods to increase personal safety

When discussing potential engagement it is important to give consideration to the types of engagement to be undertaken and the data that is to be collected. There are two types of data – quantitative and qualitative, and depending on the data that is to be collected can influence the type of questions which are set. Quantitative data is information that can be given a value or a score and can be used to provide a measurement of something. Whereas qualitative data is more about understanding meanings and gathering opinions on a subject, including people’s experiences, beliefs and ideas.

2. Conclusion

This discussion item enables the Scrutiny Panel to consider the purpose, scope and objectives of any potential engagement to be carried out as part of reviewing the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

As part of the consideration of this item the Scrutiny Panel are requested to identify and agree the purpose, scope, methods and objectives of any engagement activity to be carried out as part of reviewing the Impact of the Part Night Street Lighting Policy.

3. Background Papers

There are no background papers used in the preparation of this report.

This report was written by Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer and Rachel Wilson, Democratic Services Officer who can be contacted on 01522 552102 or 01522 552107 respectively or by e-mail at daniel.steel@lincolnshire.gov.uk or rachel.wilson@lincolnshire.gov.uk